Committee Charge

- Given to them by the NIU Board of Trustees in late 2017.
- Benchmark best practices in presidential searches and make recommendations to the BoT.
- Benchmark presidential contracts; including salary, bonus, other compensation and contract language. This working group will not be making recommendations, but rather will present the benchmark data for use by the NIU BoT.
- Create the Presidential Profile/Job Description and storyboard for the NIU Points of Pride.
Committee Members

- Dennis Barsema, Board of Trustees (chair)
- Fred Barnhart, Council of Deans
- Pete Garrity, Alumni Association Board member
- Montel Gayles, Foundation Board member
- Nathan Hays, undergraduate student
- Katy Jaekel, faculty member
- Kevin Luginbill, graduate student
- Debra Miller, Supportive Professional Staff Council member
- Linda Saborio, Executive Secretary of the University Council
- Isti Sanga, instructor
- George Slotsve, faculty member
- Kendall Thu, faculty member
- Mary Wyzard, Operating Staff Council member
Committee was divided into small working groups assigned to one of the three initiatives

Committee met on:

– January 25th
– February 22nd
– March 29th
– April 19th
– May 15th

Working groups met on their own in between meetings as needed, subject to the OMA.
All committee members had the opportunity to give feedback to any of the groups on their methods/process/results during the Committee meetings.
THANK YOU TO ALL THE COMMITTEE MEMBERS FOR YOUR DEDICATION, COMMITMENT AND HARD WORK!

THANK YOU TO THOSE THAT SUPPORTED THE WORKING GROUPS; INCLUDING MATT STREB, LAURA SALA, AND ABBY DEAN.
Benchmarking Presidential Searches for NIU

Presidential Search Preparation Committee
Trustee Dennis Barsema, Chair
Northern Illinois University

Ad Hoc Working Group Members: Debra Miller, Kendall Thu, and Mary Wyzard

NIU Anthropology Student Involvement: Jakob Daraban, Christine Dose, Aaron Lewis, Emily Stephen

Spring 2018
Introduction

• **Purpose:** benchmark peer institution presidential searches to guide BOT on best practices for NIU Presidential search.
  – Includes Presidents and Chancellors
• **Methods:** website searches and qualitative data via phone interviews and written responses from peer institution leaders involved in searches.
  – Results are a mix of themes from multiple institutions, as well as individual responses.
Background

- **IPEDS Data**
  - IPEDS = Integrated postsecondary education data system
    - U.S. Dept. of Education Annual Surveys of Higher Education
- **IPEDS Peer Institution Data for NIU**
  - 36 institutions with Presidential searches in the past five years identified
    - All 36 institutions contacted
    - 18 interviews/responses
    - 18 no responses (two institutions had completely closed searches with NDAs and could not share info)
Institutions Interviewed

1. Northeastern Illinois University
2. Indiana University - Purdue
3. SIU Carbondale
4. SIU Edwardsville
5. University of Texas @ San Antonio
6. University of Texas @ Dallas
7. University of New Hampshire
8. University of Wisconsin-Milwaukee
9. University of South Alabama
10. University of North Carolina-Greensboro
11. University of Toronto
12. Auburn University
13. University of Alabama
14. Ohio University
15. San Diego State University
16. Northern Arizona University
17. University of Texas, Arlington
18. Illinois State University, Normal
Interviewee University Position

- **University Position**
  - BOT members & Search Chairs
  - Administrators, e.g. Senior Atty, Communications Director
  - Faculty
  - Staff for BOT
- **Experience**
  - 3-30 years at University
  - 1-4 Presidential Searches
Interview Questions

- **Background on person being interviewed.**
  - Position at university.
  - Experience in the selection process.

- **Search committee rep or other knowledgeable person.**
  - Who was consulted during the search process?
  - Was it open or closed? What is your definition of those terms?
  - How were stakeholders involved? Do you think stakeholder voices were heard? How did you get stakeholder feedback?
  - How was the selection done?
  - Did you use a search firm and how well did that work?
  - Did you include diversity on your committee and how did you accomplish it?
  - Any risks that we should be aware of in the search process?
  - How were students involved?
  - How do you think student voices were heard, if at all?
  - How did the student rep get information from the student body?
  - What were the strengths and weaknesses of your process? What would you have done differently?
Search Committee

• Search committee membership and stakeholder groups consulted during the search process overlapped
  – On-campus community
    • Faculty, staff, BOT members, students, alumni, Foundation, shared governance, diverse groups, e.g. African-American student association
  – Off-campus
    • Community members and business leaders

• Search Committee
  – Tension between size, inclusiveness, and functionality
  – 12-24 members
  – Try and avoid members advocating favorites
Search Committee Recommendations

• Recommend 18-23 members
  – Diverse socio-demographics and campus groups/organizations
  – Request a slate of three candidates from each college to facilitate diversity

• ARTICLE 8 of NIU Constitution concerning Presidential Search Committee composition (18 individuals):
  – University Council Executive Secretary
  – One tenured faculty member from each degree-granting college (7) and the university libraries (1)
  – Three additional tenured faculty members from the degree-granting colleges, apportioned so as to reflect in so far as possible the ratio between the number of regular full-time faculty members in each college to the total number of faculty members in all colleges used in the most recent apportionment of faculty seats on the University Council
  – Two undergraduate students selected by the Student Association
  – One graduate student selected by the student members of the Graduate Council
  – One operating staff member selected by the Operating Staff Council;
  – One supportive professional staff member selected by the Supportive Professional Staff Council
  – One alumni representative selected by the Northern Illinois University Alumni Association

• Additional recommendations (5 individuals):
  – Chair appointed by BOT, VP for diversity, one Foundation rep, one Athletics rep, and one community rep.
Diversity on Search Committee

- Ensure underrepresented groups are on the committee by ethnicity, race, gender, age, sexual orientation/identity, and disability
  - Avoid tokenism (one person embodying multiple diversities)
  - Balance between groups
- Include VP of diversity on search committee.
- **Recommendation:** build a search committee that reflects the University
Open/Closed Search

- Open, confidential until finalists announced: 13 of 18 peer institutions contacted
- Closed: 5 of 18 peer institutions contacted

- Tension between transparency, stakeholder buy-in, and getting good candidates
- When closed suspicions among stakeholders rise
  - When closed misreporting from stakeholders and media increases
    - Candidates should only contact the search firm before the final candidates are announced. If they contact University they might be subject to FOIA under public records laws
    - Candidate name confidentiality is important until finalists announced.
    - Recommendation: names of candidates remain confidential until finalists are announced, then the search becomes open.
How were stakeholders involved in final candidate campus visits?

- Public forums, student surveys, and public listening tours
  - Importance of using non-work hour opportunities for people to make meetings outside work hours
  - **Recommendation: Anonymous in-person paper forms and online forms for finalist feedback**

- Search committee members may recommend candidates to the search firm, but NOT contact potential candidates directly

- Satellite campus involvement & representation

- Ensure survey responses are authenticated and avoid response duplication.
How were students involved?
(with input from the four NIU students involved in the planning process)

• Representatives on search committee
• Student organizations should hold meetings with candidates
  – Student government
• Students invited to public forums and meetings
  – Including students not associated with student organizations
  – Make sure public meetings are held when students are around
• Both undergrad and grad student involvement
• Search committee meet with student groups: what qualities students want in President
• Recommendation: student voices and perspectives should be considered for final candidate
Experiences with Search Firms

• Important to utilize a search firm
  – They understand logistics of searches
• Get higher caliber candidates and protects their confidentiality
• Know the search firm
  – Interview the search firms
  – Look to other institutions where the search firm in question was used

• Collaborate with search firm, don’t let them do all the work
• When using a search firm, remember it’s our time, our university, our money, and our search
Risks, Strengths, & Weaknesses of Search Processes

• Beware of candidates that are only good interviewees
• Beware of bias on search committee & firm
• Do homework on search firms
• Make own decision, don’t just follow search firm
• Early confidentiality is hard to maintain
  – Non-disclosure before final candidates announced
• Vet final candidates thoroughly (go to their campus)
• Nurture trust
• Stay committed to shared governance
• Be realistic

• **Recommendation: BOT strongly consider candidate with approval from stakeholders including faculty, staff and students, avoid selecting candidates lacking support**
Summary of Recommendations to BOT

• Build a search committee that reflects the campus
• Search Committee recommendations:
  – Recommend 18-23 members
  – Diverse socio-demographics and campus groups/organizations
  – Follow Article 8 of NIU Constitution for required membership
  – In addition: Chair appointed by BOT, VP for diversity, one Foundation rep, one community rep, and one athletics rep.
• Keep search closed until finalists are brought to campus; names of candidates remain confidential until finalists are announced, then search becomes open.
• When using a search firm, remember it’s our time, our university, our money, and our search
• Anonymous in-person forms and online forms for finalist feedback
• Student voices and perspectives should be considered for final candidate
• Strongly consider candidate with approval from stakeholders including faculty, staff and students; avoid selecting candidates lacking support
List of Contacts for BOT

- University of S Alabama, Senior Attorney
  - Jean Walker Tucker
  - Email: jwtucker@southalabama.edu Phone: 251-460-6294

- UT Systems Executive Vice Chancellor for Academic Affairs
  - Dr. Steven Leslie
  - Email: sleslie@utsystem.edu Phone: 512-499-4237

- University of N Carolina, Greensboro, BOT and Search Chair
  - Susan Safran
  - Email: susan.m.safran@gmail.com Phone: 919-218-1519

- Indiana University, Purdue, Search Committee Chair and Faculty Member
  - Gene Tempel
  - Email: etempel@Indiana.edu

- Northeastern Illinois University, Assistant Secretary to BOT
  - Karl Voigt
  - Email: k-voigt@neiu.edu Phone: 773-442-5416

- Northern Arizona University, VP of Faculty Senate
  - Bruce Fox
  - Email: bruce.fox@nau.edu

- San Diego State University, University Senate Chair
  - Marcie Bober-Michel
  - Email: Bober@sdsu.edu Phone: 619-867-7717

- University of Alabama, Senior Vice Chancellor for Communication and Community Relations
  - Kellee Reinhart
  - Email: Kreinhart@uasystem.edu Phone: 205-348-5938
Northern Illinois University

Presidential Search Planning Committee – Contracts

Fred Barnhart
Peter Garrity
Katy Jaekel
Contracts Overview:

- Compensation
- Incentives/Bonuses
- Termination
Contract: Compensation

– Base salary

– Supplemental Compensation:
  • (usually performance-based)
  • Deferred compensation
  • Bonuses
  • Retirement

– Miscellaneous Benefits
  • Automobile
  • Moving expenses
  • Housing
  • Club memberships
  • Etc.
Peer Institutions: IPED

Base Salary:

Median  $461,680
Average $483,136
High    $901,330
Low     $340,000

(see handout for all institutions)
Peer Institutions: IPED

Bonuses:

Median $75,000
Average $78,024
High $180,000
Low $6,282
MidAmerican Conference Institutions

- University of Akron
- Bowling Green State University
- State University of New York at Buffalo
- Kent State University
- Miami University of Ohio
- Ohio University
- Ball State University
- Central Michigan University
- Eastern Michigan University
- Northern Illinois University
- University of Toledo
- Western Michigan University

(Red: denotes schools contained in survey data)
MAC Institutions:

Base Salary:

Median $450,000
Average $447,151
High $509,850
Low $397,916
MAC Institutions:

**Bonuses:**

- Median: $57,000
- Average: $88,106
- High: $265,000
- Low: $25,000
Illinois Universities

• Chicago State University (new president)
• Eastern Illinois University
• Governors State University
• Illinois State University
• Northeastern University
• Northern Illinois University
• Southern Illinois University (chancellors)
• Western Illinois University
• University of Illinois
• University of Illinois at Chicago
  (Red: denotes schools contained in survey data)
Illinois Institutions:

Base Salary:

- Median: $357,500
- Average: $392,919
- High: $650,000
- Low: $270,528

(includes SIU and UI System Presidents)
Illinois Institutions:

Bonuses:

Median  $75,000
Average $75,000
High   $100,000
Low    $50,000

(includes SIU and UI System Presidents)
Illinois Institutions:

Base Salary:

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Median</td>
<td>$327,500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average</td>
<td>$368,503</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High</td>
<td>$650,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low</td>
<td>$270,528</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Excluding SIU and UI System Presidents)
Illinois Institutions:

Bonuses:

Median $62,500
Average $62,500
High $75,000
Low $50,000

(Excluding SIU and UI System Presidents)
Illinois Institutions:

Base Salary:

Median $315,000
Average $337,225
High $450,000
Low $270,528

(Excluding SIU, UI Presidents and Urbana Champaign Chancellor)
Illinois Institutions:

Bonuses:

Median $62,500
Average $62,500
High $75,000
Low $50,000

(Excluding SIU, UI Presidents, and Urbana Champaign Chancellor)
Contract: Supplemental Compensation

• Performance related to:
  – Enrollment
  – Retention
  – Performance
  – Fundraising

• Completion of contract

• Foundation will sometimes supplement salary
Contract: Termination

• Four Types of Termination
  – With Cause
  – Without Cause
  – Resignation
  – Death or disability
Without Cause:

- Severance packages often
- May still have vested in benefits, including retirement
- May have tenure and right to return to faculty, with adjusted pay
- Some institutions offer no severance and no faculty position
Contract: Termination

– Early resignation
  • President informs Board in advance (6 – 12 months)
  • Depending upon timing, may be eligible for deferred compensation and benefits earned
  • Some become emeritus and continue fundraising

– Death or Disability
  • Upon death, contract will be terminated
  • In the event the president becomes unable to perform job duties due to disability, contract will be terminated
Illinois Bill SB3604

• Called the **Government Severance Pay Act**:  
  – Misconduct is understood as:
    • Conscious disregard of employer’s interest; may include willful damage, theft;
    • Carelessness or negligence that shows intentional, substantial disregard for employer’s interests;
    • Chronic absenteeism or tardiness in deliberate fashion
    • Deliberate violation of standards/regulations of State;
    • Violation of employer’s rules (unless individual did not know rule requirements and/or rule is not consistently enforced); and
    • Other conduct, such as criminal assault or battery on another employee, committing abuse/neglect on individuals in his/her care
According to Government Severance Pay Act

- Severance pay means actual or constructive compensation, including salary, and benefits to be rendered to employee who has been or is about to be terminated.

- Severance pay would be a requirement that may not exceed amount greater to 20 weeks of compensation;

- Severance would be prohibited in instances when employee has been fired by governing body for misconduct
• Includes all Illinois Public Universities and Colleges
• Applies to new contracts or employment agreements, or renewal or renegotiation of an existing contract or employment agreement, that contain a provision for severance pay.
• Does NOT apply to existing contracts or agreements.
Thank You and Questions?
POP and Presidential Profile

Presidential Search Preparation Committee --
POP and Presidential Profile ad hoc working group: Abigail Dean, Montel Gayles, Linda Saborio, George Slotsve and David Vogt

© 2017 Northern Illinois University
Benchmarking

• Kansas State University
• Virginia State University
• Miami University, Ohio
• Michigan State University – no documents; in process of hiring firm and will seek input from constituency groups this fall
• Central Michigan University – Presidential Leadership Profile
• Ohio State University – University Portrait, Presidential Profile
Public Information

What information will be shared on the NIU Presidential Search webpage?

- Timeline for search process
- General information regarding the search process
- Roster of Presidential Search Committee members
- Live streaming of public forums (if open search)
- Periodic updates on the search process
- Presidential Profile and Points of Pride documents
- News and other related documents
Presidential Profile

- Intro to NIU: mission and vision
- Leadership qualities: 5 initiatives (input from PSPC members; published articles)
- Personal characteristics (input from BOT visits to various shared governance groups fall 2017)
- Professional qualifications (input from BOT visits and PSPC members)
- NIU’s Key Institutional Success Indicators (information from the BOT goals; input from PSPC members)
Points of Pride

Driven by NIU Brand

• Large University Resources
• Individually-Centered/Small College Feel
• Career Success

Each section

• Facts (statistics)
• Short info (2-4 sentences)
• Full Stories (approx. 500 -1,000 words)
• Videos

Themes throughout – Research and Diversity